

Children's Literature Association  
**Quarterly**



Winter 2014 | Volume 39 | Number 4



from textbooks. The comprehensive footnotes that accompany her study with her selected bibliography and index attest to a tremendous amount of research. Schneider's treatment of the topic is thorough and authoritative, reflecting her status as both a researcher in the field of children's literature and a first-rate teacher within the French university-level system of teacher training programs. Her comparative study brings to light international research, namely from the USA, with experts in Francophone literatures, postcolonial studies, and children's literature. This volume will serve as an important resource for any scholar researching topics related to these disciplines, and for future teachers in France at all levels.

Anne Cirella-Urrutia is an adjunct professor of French at Huston-Tillotson University. She has published several articles on children's literature in *Les cahiers*, *Robinson*, *ChLA Quarterly*, *Bookbird*, *ImageText: Interdisciplinary Comic Studies*, and *Journal of Graphic Novels and Comics*, and several book reviews in *The French Review*.



Lewis Carroll's *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland* and *Through the Looking-Glass: A Publishing History*. By Zoe Jaques and Eugene Giddens. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2013.

Reviewed by Jan Susina

Morton Cohen, author of the standard biography of Lewis Carroll, has written that the publication history of *The Nursery Alice* is "a tangled tale of enormous complexity" (63). Zoe Jaques and Eugene Giddens have attempted

an even more ambitious and tangled project in writing a publishing history of Carroll's *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland* and its many subsequent textual offshoots. In their detailed study of the prepublication history of Carroll's most famous works, they emphasize how directly involved he was in the physical production of his books, and how he consciously cultivated a growing Alice industry that would reach as wide a market as possible. Carroll was a demanding author who valued quality book production over profit, but at the same time he was a savvy marketer looking to expand the market and audience for his Alice brand. Jaques and Giddens structure their publishing history of the Alice books using D. F. McKenzie's concept of the "sociology of the text," so that their study includes the multiple versions produced during Carroll's lifetime as well as their textual afterlives. In addition to the various Alice texts created by Carroll, the authors also examine some of the many textual and nonbook objects created and produced by others after his death.

Using Carroll's letters and diaries—drawing particularly upon Cohen and Anita Gandolfo's *Carroll and the House of Macmillan*, a significant volume of correspondence between Carroll and his lifelong publisher—Jaques and Giddens present the literary development of Carroll's oral tale originally told to Alice Liddell and her sisters, which was then transformed into the self-illustrated *Alice's Adventures Under Ground* and refined into *Alice's Adventures in Wonderland*, illustrated by *Punch* cartoonist John

Tenniel. Carroll was fortunate in seeking publication with Macmillan, which had previously had success with Charles Kingsley's children's fantasy *The Water-Babies* (1863), since few publishers would have been so accommodating of such a fastidious and demanding author. They put to rest the myth that the story of *Wonderland* was extemporized by Carroll in a single day, showing how he tinkered and fine-tuned the text of *Wonderland* and *Looking-Glass* throughout his life, making numerous small additions, alterations, and corrections to the books prior to their final editions in 1887.

Jaques and Giddens suggest that it is the "flexibility, rather than the fixity" of the Alice texts that has enabled them become and remain classic children's books (151). The first major wave of conscious uncoupling of Carroll's text and Tenniel's illustrations occurred in 1907, when the copyright for the Alice books expired in England and alternative illustrations were published, with mixed response. Since copyright in the United States was not granted to noncitizens at this time, the earliest versions of the books with non-Tenniel illustrations actually appeared there.

While this evolving nature of *Alice* has contributed to its longevity, it also means that *Wonderland* has become much larger than Carroll's initial conception of the story, having expanded through various retellings into a large body of books, art, music, film, drama, and dance. The writers raise the vexing question: What constitutes *Alice* in the popular imagination? They observe that while *Alice* has acquired talismanic properties that are used to grab

attention, many modern adaptations have little connection to the original novels. They maintain that Alice herself has become such an iconic figure, like Hamlet holding a skull, that the public assumes it "knows" Alice without having read either *Wonderland* or *Looking-Glass*" (214). While this may be the case, it is slightly disturbing and reminiscent of Stephen Colbert's concept of "truthiness," in which assumptions replace evidence or facts.

Examining *Wonderland* as reimagined by others, Jaques and Giddens observe that it is "difficult to overstate the continued importance of Walt Disney's *Alice in Wonderland*," despite the film initially being a flop when it was released in 1951. They recognize a striking binary in the post-Disney adaptations, in that *Wonderland* versions can be "serious, or playful, but rarely both" (219). The playful versions are intended for children, while the more serious and troubling ones are created for older readers and viewers. Building on the important scholarship of Carolyn Sigler's *Alternative Alices: Visions and Revisions of Lewis Carroll's Alice Books* (1999), Will Brooker's *Alice's Adventures: Lewis Carroll in Popular Culture* (2004), and Christopher Hollingsworth's *Alice Beyond Wonderland: Essays for the Twenty-first Century* (2009), Jaques and Giddens extend their study of *Alice's* afterlives to include recent adaptations such as Tim Burton's film *Alice in Wonderland* (2010), Atomic Antelope's popular *Alice for the iPad* (2010), and Yayoi Kusama's brightly polka-dotted version of *Wonderland* (2012). They also recognize a "disturbing sexualization of the character of Alice," and feel

that “the divide between *Alice* for children and *Alice* for adults has never been stronger” (224). After providing a selective study of the influential contemporary versions of *Alice*, they conclude that like many literary texts, *Wonderland* has been used for “both good and ill, it has produced the beautiful and the grotesque” (227).

The most significant discovery that Jaques and Giddens make is a convincing explanation for Carroll’s famous canceling of the first edition of *Wonderland*. Like finding the answer to the Hatter’s riddle, Carroll scholars have long speculated about what caused Carroll to make the costly decision to recall the book after distributing signed copies to his friends. After a careful comparison of three different “first” editions housed at the Harry Ransome Center—the recalled first edition printed by Oxford University Press; the significantly better printed edition by Richard Clay that replaced the first printing; and the Appleton edition, which consisted of the discarded pages from the first printing that were sold in the United States—the writers have determined that it was the quality of the paper that caused the inferior inking of Tenniel’s illustrations. The poor quality of paper used by Oxford University Press allowed “the ink to seep through to the reverse of the sheets,” blurring the illustrations (30). The second printing by Clay used “less coarse grain, higher gloss, and greater density” paper, which resulted in crisper illustrations (30). Carroll considered the second printing of *Wonderland* by Clay “very far superior to the old, and in fact a perfect piece of artistic printing” (22;

original emphasis). He was so disappointed with the first printing that he wanted to sell the unbound copies as wastepaper, but was persuaded by Macmillan to sell the inferior pages to Appleton in New York. Carroll believed Americans had little interest in printing quality, so long as their books were cheap. In unraveling this question, Jaques and Giddens show the importance in publishing history of distinguishing between the printer, the binder, and the publisher.

The authors have written a compelling and richly detailed publishing history of the *Alice* books that both unravels the complicated pre-publication history of *Wonderland* and *Looking-Glass* and discusses the curious ways *Alice* has been transformed by Carroll and others. Upon being confronted with some recent adaptations, one can well imagine a confused Carroll asking, “Who are you?” Indeed, many of these seem to suggest that Carroll’s *Alice* doesn’t live here anymore.

## Work Cited

Cohen, Morton N. *Lewis Carroll: A Biography*. New York: Knopf, 1995.

*Jan Susina is a professor of English at Illinois State University. He is the author of The Place of Lewis Carroll in Children’s Literature (2009).*

